glacial-scale enrichment would result in an air-to-sea flux of about 4.6 mol C m⁻² year⁻¹ or about 2 Pg C year⁻¹ over an oceanic area of 3.6 × 10⁵ km² (50°S to 65°S). Seasonal ice cover may reduce this estimate by a factor of 2. These estimates are several times larger than the present net annual Southern Ocean (south of 50°S) uptake of CO₂ of 0.4 Pg C year⁻¹ (1) and comparable to the current global ocean net uptake of atmospheric CO₂. Dilution-corrected estimates of higher atmospheric iron input, which occurred during the last glacial maximum, provide confidence to their impact on atmospheric composition because the large-scale impacts of iron enrichment on midwater processes and the length scales of POC remineralization are not yet known. The results strongly suggest, however, that the Southern Ocean was more productive and exported more carbon during periods of higher atmospheric iron input, which occurred during the last glacial maximum.

References and Notes
17. R. Schlitzer, EOS 81, 45 (2000).
21. Iron enrichments were conducted by R/V Revelle. The northern patch was deployed 10 to 12 January 2002 at 56.23°S and 172°W by injecting 631 kg of iron (as acidic iron sulfated dissolved in seawater) into the ship’s wake and spread over an area of 225 km². Iron enrichments in the north patch of 631 kg and 450 kg were repeated on 16 January and 10 February, respectively. The southern patch was deployed 24 to 26 January at 66.43°S and 171.8°W, with repeated influsions on 29 January, 1 February, and 5 February. Each infusion involved 315 kg spread over a 225 km² area. For both patches, initial iron enrichments were supplemented with enrichments of SF₆ and ³He as inert chemical tracers. This allowed for rapid detection of the injected area and provided estimates of mixing and gas exchange with the atmosphere. Lagrangian drifter buoys were deployed both inside and outside the enriched areas.
41. R. R. Bidigare et al., EOS 83 (suppl.), F798 (2002).
50. We wish to thank the entire SOFeX group, crew, and officers of RV Revelle, RV Melville, and U.S. Coast Guard Research Ice Breaker Polar Star and two very thorough reviewers. This research was supported by grants from NSF, Chemical and Biological Oceanography, and U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Science, Biological and Environmental Research.

Supporting Online Material
www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/304/5669/408/DC1
Materials and Methods
Figs. S1 to S5
Tables S1 and S2
References
29 July 2003; accepted 25 March 2004

REPORTS

The Effects of Iron Fertilization on Carbon Sequestration in the Southern Ocean
Ken O. Buesseler,* John E. Andrews, Steven M. Pike, Matthew A. Charette

An unresolved issue in ocean and climate sciences is whether changes to the surface ocean input of the micronutrient iron can alter the flux of carbon to the deep ocean. During the Southern Ocean Iron Experiment, we measured an increase in the flux of particulate carbon from the surface mixed layer, as well as changes in particle cycling below the iron-fertilized patch. The flux of carbon was similar in magnitude to that of natural blooms in the Southern Ocean and thus small relative to global carbon budgets and proposed geoengineering plans to sequester atmospheric carbon dioxide in the deep sea.

As the largest high nutrient–low chlorophyll region, the Southern Ocean was chosen for a purposeful iron fertilization experiment, SOFeX (Southern Ocean Iron Experiment). The experiment was conducted at two sites both north and south of the Antarctic Polar Front, in low- and high-silicate waters, respectively. We focus here on the “southern patch” where the inert tracer SF₆ and four enrichments of iron were added to a 15 km by 15 km patch (66°S, 172°W), which was tracked and monitored by three ships in a Lagrangian fashion for 1 month in January to February 2002. As in previous experiments (1–3), the addition of the essential micronutrient iron led to measurable decreases in dissolved inorganic carbon and nutrients within the surface mixed layer (upper 40 to 50 m) associated with enhanced growth of marine phytoplankton, the details of which are described in the accompanying article by Coale et al. (4).

Department of Marine Chemistry and Geochemistry, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, MA 02543, USA.

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: kbuesseler@whoi.edu
As part of SOFeX, we used naturally occurring radionuclide $^{234}$Th (half-life = 24.1 days) as an in situ tracer of the sinking flux of particles. $^{234}$Th has a high affinity for particle surfaces, and its removal on sinking particles results in a $^{234}$Th "deficit," i.e., measured $^{234}$Th activities that are less than those of its long-lived and soluble parent, $^{238}$U, which is the primary source of $^{234}$Th in seawater. "Excess" $^{234}$Th may be observed at depth due to remineralization of sinking particles, such that the rate of regeneration of $^{234}$Th from sinking particles exceeds the local production and decay balance. Measurements of $^{234}$Th can be used to calculate the net flux of $^{234}$Th on sinking particles at any given depth, and its ratio to particulate carbon and other particle-associated elements can be used to determine the sinking flux of particulate organic carbon (POC) and other elements from the surface ocean (5, 6).

During SOFeX, we observed at the earliest station "IN" the patch (day 5.8), and throughout the experiment at "OUT" control stations, a $^{234}$Th deficit within the mixed layer (depths <40 to 50 m) and excess $^{234}$Th below these depths (Fig. 1, A and C) (the presence of SF$_6$ tracer was used during SOFeX to determine IN versus OUT locations). This $^{234}$Th profile is typical of this site late in the growth season (7) and in many other oceanic settings. Within the iron-fertilized patch we observed over time both a deepening and increasing $^{234}$Th deficit, and a decrease in excess $^{234}$Th at depth (see time-sequence Movie S1 of $^{234}$Th activity distributions). Because hydrographic conditions between IN and OUT stations were indistinguishable, we attribute these changes to the impact of iron fertilization on particle export.

By the end of the 28-day observation period, fluxes of particulate $^{234}$Th out of the upper mixed layer increased within the patch (fluxes at 50 m are calculated from the 0- to 50-m total $^{234}$Th activity) (Fig. 1, B and D). Of particular interest are enhanced $^{234}$Th fluxes below 50 m, deeper than where the iron was introduced and the primary growth response was observed [details of the vertical structure and biomass and growth responses can be found in Coale et al. (4)]. Overall, the lower average $^{234}$Th activities in the patch between 0 and 100 m result in higher calculated particulate $^{234}$Th fluxes.

As with particulate $^{234}$Th fluxes, the sinking flux of POC IN was greater than POC flux OUT at the end of 28 days (Fig. 2). These differences were largest deeper in the water column at 100 m versus 50 m. The 100-m POC fluxes of 12.4 mM C m$^{-2}$ day$^{-1}$ were 20% the rates of biological carbon uptake as measured by $^{14}$C primary-production methods near the end of SOFeX (4). This POC export flux is consistent with an estimate of the balance between the drawdown of inorganic C and increase in stocks of POC in the SOFeX southern patch (4).

Our major findings are as follows: As the experiment progressed, more particulate $^{234}$Th escaped below 50 m at the base of the iron-fertilized patch; also, the impact on particle flux extended into the deeper waters. This implies changes in the quantity and quality of sinking particles such that more particles were removed from the upper 50 m, and they were less prone to remineralization. Little is known about remineralization controls, but changes in sinking rate, density, or ballasting biominerals likely play a role (8, 9). It is also possible that subsurface communities feeding on detrital particles responded to the change in food supply. These heterotrophic processes can enhance flux by converting smaller suspended particles into those that sink rapidly. However, there were no obvious subsurface changes in particle composition or heterotrophic activity during SOFeX, and therefore we cannot resolve the cause of this subsurface change in particle cycling.

In the context of previous blooms in this region, the POC flux during SOFeX was relatively small. During the same month in 1998 at this site, the $^{234}$Th-derived POC flux at 100 m was 20 mM C m$^{-2}$ day$^{-1}$ (7). The export of POC and associated nutrients in 1998 was in close agreement with independent estimates of export determined by the seasonal balance of nutrient supply and export (10). POC fluxes at the OUT control stations in 2002 were only 3 to 5 mM C m$^{-2}$ day$^{-1}$ at 100 m, indicating considerable interannual variability in the magnitude and/or seasonality of POC flux. Measurements of much lower biogenic silica concentrations at the start of SOFeX (11) suggest that the lower POC flux OUT was associated with decreased diatom abundances, a siliceous plankton group that is thought to be a major vector of vertical carbon transport out of the surface ocean (6, 12).

Although the POC flux IN at 100 m at the end of SOFeX was slightly lower than in 1998, and thus not large relative to the natural cycle, it was considerably enhanced relative
to that of the OUT stations. That the POC fluxes were not higher IN may indicate that we did not reach the end of the SOFeX bloom. Observations and modeling suggest a 20- to 30-day lag between the onset of phytoplankton growth and export in these cold Southern Ocean waters (7, 13). As in all previous iron experiments, SOFeX used multiple additions of iron (Fe was added starting on days 0, 4, 3, 8, 1, and 11.2), and thus our final observations were only ~17 days after the last iron addition.

Observations of enhanced iron concentrations, high photosynthetic efficiency, and sustained elevated biomass concentrations suggest strongly that the phytoplankton community was not iron stressed even at the end of our 28-day observation period (4). Without higher grazing pressure by zooplankton or limitation by other nutrients or physical controls, there was no obvious “trigger” for the crash of this iron-induced bloom. As such, we do not feel we reached the end of this SOFeX bloom.

It has been difficult in previous iron fertilization experiments in the Southern Ocean to demonstrate an obvious POC flux response, although in every case enhanced phytoplankton growth has been seen. SOIREE (Southern Ocean IRon Enrichment Experiment) took place in February 1999 at 61°S 140°E (2), and within a shorter, 13-day observation period, no measurable changes in POC flux were observed. SOFeX data were obtained either by using the 234Th method (14) or by comparing IN versus OUT differences during 2- to 3-day shallow sediment trap deployments (15). EisenEx (Iron Experiment) took place in November 2000 at 48°S 21°E (16), and 22 days of 234Th observations showed no differences between activities IN versus OUT of the fertilized patch (17). EisenEx did result in a decrease over time in the sum of dissolved and particulate C stocks, and this was used to calculate a POC flux that was higher IN than OUT, in contrast to their 234Th results (17).

SOFeX also conducted an experiment in the “northern patch” where silicate concentrations were much lower (<2 μM versus 60 μM in south). Peak primary production rates were roughly twice as high in the north, whereas chlorophyll a levels were somewhat lower (4). Our comparison of 234Th early versus late in the northern patch did not show an obvious difference (18), but the data were only from one pair of 234Th profiles and were hampered by the limited and more difficult sampling of the elongated and narrower northern patch (4). However, evidence for enhanced POC flux in the northern patch was obtained using an autonomous float to measure particle abundances. This approach provides a lower limit of 120 to 190 μM C m⁻² for 100-m POC flux in the northern patch, and an upper limit of 760 to 1170 μM C m⁻² after 50 days (19). In these same units our southern patch POC flux was 225 μM C m⁻², closer to the lower estimate. One difference is that the increase in POC flux in the north took place between patch days 25 and 45, demonstrating a lag between phytoplankton growth and POC flux that is longer than our 28-day observation period of bloom conditions in the south.

These few studies of the ocean’s POC export response to iron have thus shown limited or no export response, or perhaps variability in POC export, as found here between the southern and northern patch using different methods. Fundamentally, we expect particulate export to vary as a function of plankton community structure and its physiological status (20, 21). Each iron fertilization experiment was conducted at a different time of the year in different biogeochemical settings in the Southern Ocean, so differences in the biological response and community structure might be expected.

Some of this apparent variability between studies may simply be related to the duration of observations, and/or data coverage and methods. Our new small-volume 234Th method (22) allowed for high spatial and temporal coverage during SOFeX. Our conclusion here of enhanced particle export relies on subtle changes in the evolving 234Th profiles that would not have been observed with the low-resolution 234Th sampling techniques used during SOIREE and EisenEx.

Finally, physical differences in the experimental setting for each iron fertilization experiment should be considered when looking at variability in POC flux. Modeling suggests that the formation of sinking aggregates is sensitive to the rates of growth (slower in colder waters) and advective losses (23). The SOIREE patch experienced considerable stretching and dilution as the experiment progressed (24), whereas the southern SOFeX site maintained a generally coherent patch structure (4) more conducive to aggregation. The observation of a biomass decrease and surface POC flux increase after 1 to 2 weeks during the Equatorial Pacific iron fertilization experiment, EisenEx II (25), was attributed to the four times higher ratio of growth to lateral advection seen in IronEx II relative to SOIREE.

In light of these SOFeX C-flux estimates, are geoengineering proposals for reducing the greenhouse effect through iron-enhanced carbon sequestration realistic? Using a patch size of 1000 km² (approximate area on 12 February with chlorophyll >0.4 mg m⁻³), a time scale of 21 days (234Th deficits increased during weeks 2 to 4), and the average difference in the IN versus OUT POC flux of 7 μM C m⁻² day⁻¹, we estimate that SOFeX resulted in an enhanced flux at 100 m of 1800 tons of C in response to the addition of 1.26 tons of iron (4). However, because on average, >50% of the C carried on sinking particles at 100 m is remineralized by 250 m (26), the true estimate of C sequestration to depths below the more rapidly ventilated Antarctic Surface Waters (27) would be even lower, or only about 900 tons of C. When compared to the rates of carbon released globally due to human activities (6.5 × 10⁹ tons/year), this C flux is indeed a small number. Also, with a Csequestered:Fe added ratio of 3.3 × 10⁴ (molar ratio; export at 250 m; fluxes through day 28), it is difficult to see how ocean iron fertilization with such a low Csequestered:Fe added export efficiency would easily scale up to solve our larger global C imbalance problems (28).

One could argue that C flux increased after we left the site, or that there are other pathways of C export in addition to C flux on sinking particles measured here. For example, there are pathways of C loss due to accumulation and removal of dissolved organic C or suspended POC stocks. However, these processes involve physical mixing with
surrounding shallow-water masses and are not efficient relative to direct sequestration of C on sinking particles to the deep ocean. We do not know whether the bloom eventually led to substantially higher C export after we left, or whether organic matter was remineralized within the ocean surface, resulting in no additional impact on C sequestration.

We have shown that iron addition to the Southern Ocean had a measurable impact on POC export, with flux increases observed not only within the iron-fertilized waters but also below the mixed layer in the “shadow” of the SOFeX patch. However, the magnitude of this flux increase was small relative to that of natural blooms in this region, or as needed to reduce current increases in atmospheric CO₂. To more accurately scale this flux response to iron as delivered in past climate cycles via dust or in proposed greenhouse mitigation schemes would require longer observations, comparisons between single versus multiple iron additions, deeper flux measurements, and larger patch scales to minimize artifacts due to dilution effects.

References and Notes

17. U. Biesebes, personal communication.
31. We thank our many SOFeX collaborators, in partic-
ular K. Coale and K. Johnson, as well as the many scientists and crews aboard the RV Revelle, RV Melville, and U.S. Coast Guard Research Ice Breaker Polar Star, who made this experiment possible. We also thank two anonymous reviewers whose sugges-
tions improved the paper. This work was supported by the Division of Ocean Sciences at NSF; the Bio-
logical and Environmental Research Office, Office of Science, U.S. Department of Energy; and Polar Pro-
grams, NSF. This is Woods Hole Oceanographic In-
stitution contribution no. 11047.

Robotic Observations of Enhanced Carbon Biomass and Export at 55°S During SOFeX

James K. B. Bishop,¹ Todd J. Wood,¹ Russ E. Davis,² Jeffrey T. Sherman²

Autonomous floats profiling in high-nitrate low-silicate waters of the Southern Ocean observed carbon biomass variability and carbon exported to depths of 100 m during the 2002 Southern Ocean Iron Experiment (SOFeX) to detect the effects of iron fertilization of surface water there. Control and “in-patch” measurements documented a greater than fourfold enhancement of carbon biomass in the iron-amended waters. Carbon export through 100 m increased two- to sixfold as the patch subducted below a front. The molar ratio of iron added to carbon exported ranged between 10⁴ and 10⁵. The biomass buildup and export were much higher than expected for iron-amended low-silicate waters.

The Southern Ocean plays a critical role in the global carbon cycle and in the regulation of levels of atmospheric CO₂ (1–3), yet the biological and physical processes that sequester carbon remain poorly understood largely because of the difficulties in making observ-
ations in waters surrounding Antarctica. The January to February 2002 SOFeX (4) was designed to examine the biological and carbon system response to the effects of pur-
poseful addition of iron to nitrate-rich waters north and south of the Polar Front Zone (PFZ). Iron was added to two ~225 km² regions near 55°S 172°W and 66°S 172°W to test the hypothesis that the lack of dissolved silicate would limit both biomass growth and carbon export. Waters north and south of the PFZ had dissolved nitrate:silicate concentrations of 22:2.5 μM and 27:60 μM, respectively. The “North Patch” at 55°S was considered to be silicate limiting.

Three free-profiling robotic Lagrangian Carbon Explorers (5) were deployed at 55°S from the research vessel (RV) Roger Revelle to provide high-frequency (three times per day) profile observations of particulate organic carbon (POC) (6), Temperature (T) and Salinity (S) in the upper 1000 m; a fourth was deployed at 66°S. Between profiles, the SOFeX Explorers were “parked” at 100-m depth to investigate the systematics of carbon export at 100 m with an optically derived carbon flux index (CFI) (7).

Our “control” Carbon Explorer 1177 (8) was deployed ~20 km north of the planned North Patch location on 11 January 2002; it drifted northeast parallel to bathymetry as expected for the Antarctic Circumpolar Current. Two Explorers were deployed “in the patch” (Fig. 1A). Explorer 2054 was deployed on 12 January in the planned center of the North Patch; the first infusion of iron immediately followed. Explorer 2054 immediately tracked to the northwest, reflecting a current shear that soon split the initial 15 km by 15 km iron-fertilized patch in two. The northwest segment of the iron-fertilized water was sampled by Explorer 2054, and enhanced biomass levels were traced for 14 days; sub-
sequent biomass profiles were typical of those observed by the control float. This segment was never sampled by SOFeX ships again. Explorer 2104 was deployed on 19 January (patch day 7) just prior to a second Fe infusion to the other “half” of the North Patch (9). It advected to the northeast on a course that closely paralleled that of the control (Fig. 1A). We refer to Explorer 2104 as the “in-patch” Explorer.

Over the following three weeks, the control (1177) and in-patch (2104) Explorers tracked each other closely, while relaying their surfacing positions, hydrography, and carbon mea-

www.sciencemag.org  SCIENCE  VOL 304 16 APRIL 2004 417