- Dewar, M. J. S. & Wade, L. E. A study of the mechanism of the cope rearrangement. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 99, 4417–4424 (1977).
- Ulrich, H. D. & Schultz, P. G. The evolution of binding affinity and catalysis in a family of catalytic antibodies. J. Mol. Biol. (submitted).
- Storm, D. R. & Koshland, D. E. Jr A source for the special catalytic power of enzymes: Orbital steering. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 66, 445–452 (1970).
- Janda, K. D. et al. Direct selection for a catalytic mechanism from combinatorial antibody libraries Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 91, 2532–2536 (1994).
- Tawfik, D. S., Green, B. S., Chap, R., Sela, M. & Eshhar, Z. catELISA: A facile general route to catalytic antibodies. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 90, 373–377 (1993).
- Kabat, E. A., Wu, T. T., Perry, H. M., Gottesman, K. S. & Foeller, C. Sequences of Proteins of Immunological Interest (US Dept of Health and Human Services, National Institutions of Health, Bethesda, 1991).
- Nahmias, C., Strosberg, A. D. & Emorine, L. J. The immune response toward β-adrenergic ligands their receptors. VIII. Extensive diversity of VH and VL genes encoding anti-alprenolol antibodies. J. Immunol. 140, 1304–1311 (1988).
- Otwinowski, Z. & Minor, W. Processing of X-ray diffraction data collected in oscillation mode. *Meth. Enzymol.* 276, 307–325 (1996).
- Navaza, J. AMoRe: An automated package for molecular replacement. Acta Crystallogr. A 50, 157–163 (1994).
- Strong, R. K. et al. Three-dimensional structure of a murine anti-P-azophenylarsonate FAB 36-71. 1. X-ray crystallography, site-directed mutagenesis, and modeling of the Complex with hapten. Biochemistry 30, 3739–3748 (1991).
- Jones, T. A., Zou, J.-Y., Cowan, S. W. & Kjeldgaard, M. Improved methods for building protein models in electron density maps and the location of errors in these models. *Acta Crystallogr. A* 47, 110–119 (1991).
- Brunger, A. X-PLOR, Version 3.851. A System for X-ray Crystallography and NMR (Yale Univ. Press, New Haven, Connecticut, 1996).
- Collaborative Computational Project Number 4. The CCP4 suite: Programs for protein crystallography. Acta Crystallogr. D 50, 760–763 (1994).

Acknowledgements. We thank M. Conn for precursor to the hapten, C. Cho and P. Yang for helpful discussions, and the Stanford Synchrotron Radiation Laboratory for synchrotron beam time. We are grateful for financial support for this work from the US Department of Energy and the NIH. P.G.S. is a HHMI investigator; H.D.U. was supported by a predoctoral fellowship from the NSF.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to R.C.S. or P.G.S.

Sources and contribution of terrigenous organic carbon to surface sediments in the Gulf of Mexico

Miguel A. Goñi*, Kathleen C. Ruttenberg† & Timothy I. Eglinton†

* Department of Geological Sciences, University of South Carolina, Columbia, South Carolina 29208, USA

† Department of Marine Chemistry and Geochemistry, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, Massachusetts 02543, USA

The sources and burial processes of organic matter in marine sediments are not well understood, yet they are important if we are to have a better understanding of the global carbon cycle¹. In particular, the nature and fraction of the terrestrial organic carbon preserved in marine sediments is poorly constrained. Here we use the chemical and stable carbon isotope signatures of oxidation products from a macromolecular component (lignin)² of the terrigenous organic matter preserved in offshore surface sediments in the Gulf of Mexico to complement similar data from an existing onshore transect³ in this region. The complete onshore-offshore data set, along with radiocarbon dates of the bulk organic material at the same sites, allows the differentiation of material originating from plants that photosynthesize using the C₄ mechanism from those that undergo C₃ photosynthesis. We conclude that the offshore lignins derive from erosion of the extensive grassland (C₄) soils of the Mississippi River drainage basin, and that the nearshore lignins originate largely from C₃ plant detritus from coastal forests and swamps. This distribution is probably due to the hydrodynamic sorting of the different source materials⁴ during their seaward transport. These results suggest that previous studies^{3,5} have significantly underestimated the terrigenous fraction of organic matter in offshore sediments by not recognizing the contribution of C₄ vegetation to the carbon-isotope composition. Such an underestimate may force revisions in the assessment of past marine primary productivity and associated organic carbon fluxes⁶, and of organic matter preservation/remineralization⁷ and nutrient cycling⁸ in marine sediments.

The Gulf of Mexico is an extensively studied marine environment in which the fraction of organic carbon preserved in marine sediments that is of terrigenous origin (OC_{terr}) may be particularly high, owing to the proximity of continental land masses. Draining an area⁹ of 3.3×10^6 km², which includes most of North America's grasslands¹⁰ (Fig. 1), the Mississippi River system is the predominant source of sediment⁹ and fresh water¹¹ to the Gulf. We collected surface (0–2 cm) sediments from two transects perpendicular to the shore extending across the shelf and slope (Fig. 1). The elemental and isotopic compositions of organic matter from these sediments are shown in Table 1.

Conventional ¹⁴C ages of bulk sedimentary OC range between 2,580 and 6,770 yr BP, and generally increase with water depth. On the basis of published sedimentation rates¹², the average ages of marine phytodetritus in surface (0–2 cm) sediments should range between 3 (nearshore) and 400 (offshore) calendar yr. The large difference between ¹⁴C and estimated calendar ages suggests that, even after accounting for sediment mixing and the reservoir effect on marine OC (ref. 13), a significant fraction of the sedimentary OC must be relatively 'old', and most likely allochthonous in origin. Moreover, because OC_{terr} ¹⁴C ages are not subject to oceanic reservoir corrections, this material must be composed to a large extent of reworked OC (ref. 14). Non-zero apparent ¹⁴C ages for surface sediments are commonly observed on continental shelf or



Figure 1 a, Map of the sampling locations and water depths (m) in the Gulf of Mexico. **b**, Map of the extent of the drainage basin of the Mississippi River and the grasslands in North America¹⁰. The area shown in **a** is an enlargement of the box in **b**.

letters to nature

slope environments, and are typically interpreted as resulting from relic OC_{terr} inputs¹⁵.

Sedimentary total organic carbon δ^{13} C values from both transects vary from -21.7 to -19.7‰ and display little trend with water depth¹². These generally enriched values agree well with previously published data (Fig. 2), and have been used as evidence for the dominance of autochthonous marine over terrestrially derived organic matter in offshore regions³. Such interpretations have assumed that the OC_{terr} reaching the Gulf of Mexico is derived primarily from C₃ vascular plants ($\delta^{13}C_{OC} \approx -26\%$). However, it is difficult to reconcile the proposed predominance of marine OC with the ¹⁴C ages discussed above. Here we present data that contradict the assumption of an exclusively C₃ origin for OC_{terr} and thus may help resolve this apparent discrepancy. Carbon-normalized yields of phenols derived from vascular (land) plant lignin are generally low (≤ 1.5 mg per 100 mg OC) for both transects (Table 1), and are consistent with previous observations (Fig. 2). Source parameters based on the phenol data from both transects show ratios of cinnamyl: vanillyl (C/V) ≥ 0.2 and syringyl: vanillyl (S/V) ≥ 1 (Table 1). These elevated C/V and S/V values indicate that lignin in these Gulf of Mexico sediments has a predominantly non-woody, angiosperm origin¹⁶ (for example, leaves and grasses). Because microbial degradation of vascular plant tissues alters both of these ratios¹⁷, it is imprudent to differentiate vascular plant sources much beyond this level of interpretation.

All sediments yield ratios of acid:aldehyde (ad/al) for both vanillyl and syringyl phenols that are ≥ 0.4 and generally increase offshore, reaching values as high as 3.5 (Table 1). Oxidative

Table 1 Compositional and isotopic parameters from Gulf of Mexico sediments									
Parameter	Code	Depth of transect A (m)				Depth of transect B (m)			
		107	574	598	1,470	74	605	964	2,250
Organic carbon by weight (%) Calcium carbonate by weight (%) Radiocarbon composition of organic carbon (‰)* Radiocarbon age of organic carbon (уг вР)†	% OC %CaCO ₃ $\Delta^{14}C_{OC}$ Age _{OC}	1.4 2.0 –276.8 2,580	1.4 3.8 –291.1 2,720	1.3 3.8	0.9 16.6 –393.0 3,960	0.9 7.7 –367.0 3,630	1.2 11.5 –383.5 3,840	0.6 28.7 –386.4 3,880	0.3 25.4 –572.1 6,770
Lignin phenol yields (mg per 100 mg OC) Vanillyl phenols Syringyl phenols Cinnamyl phenols Total Vanillyl + syringyl phenols‡	V S C T _{ilig} A	0.563 0.766 0.156 1.49 1.28	0.309 0.437 0.085 0.83 0.70	0.309 0.386 0.107 0.80 0.67	0.085 0.252 0.070 0.41 0.31	0.202 0.215 0.081 0.50 0.39	0.159 0.374 0.072 0.60 0.49	0.136 0.422 0.092 0.65 0.51	0.143 0.236 0.102 0.48 0.33
Lignin compositional parameters Syringyl: vanillyl ratio Cinnamyl: vanillyl ratio Vanillyl acid: aldehyde ratio Syringyl acid: aldehyde ratio	S/V C/V (ad/al) _v (ad/al) _s	1.36 0.28 0.56 0.41	1.41 0.28 0.76 1.00	1.25 0.34 0.67 0.53	2.98 0.83 0.46 1.51	1.07 0.40 0.75 1.53	2.35 0.45 1.16 0.46	3.09 0.67 1.18 0.61	1.65 0.71 0.78 3.47
Stable isotopic compositions (‰)§ Bulk OCII Syringealdehyde Syringic acid <i>p</i> -Coumaric acid Vanillin	$\delta^{13}C_{OC}$ $\delta^{13}C_{SI}$ $\delta^{13}C_{Sd}$ $\delta^{13}C_{cd}$ $\delta^{13}C_{cd}$	-21.1 -29.0 -28.5 -26.7		-20.4 -15.3 -15.4 -28.0	-19.7 -15.2	-20.9 -22.0 -22.0	-21.6 -21.8	-20.2 -23.8	-21.7 -19.9

Where no data are given, δ^{13} C was not determined owing to unsatisfactory resolution by irm-GC-MS. Irm-GC-MS data for other lignin phenols not included in this table are not available because of their low overall and insufficient chromatographic resolution which precluded accurate δ^{13} C determination. In all samples, syringic acid was the most suitable of all lignin compounds for irm-GC-MS.

* Measured by AMS.

† The error in $Age_{oc} \le 60$ years for all samples.

* Sum of vanillyl + syringyl phenol yields (A) was calculated by excluding cinnamyl phenols to compare directly to previous data³.

\$ All isotopic compositions, except for δ¹³C_{oc} which was measured by direct combustion (precision of 0.1‰) were measured by isotope ratio monitoring-gas chromatography-mass spectrometry (irm-GC-MS).

Data from ref, 12. The precision of the irm-GC-MS measurements has been determined previously², and for these samples is better than 1% for most compounds, but ranges up to 1.7% for syringic acid from the 605-m station.



Figure 2 Distribution of $\delta^{13}C_{OC}$ (circles) and Λ (triangles) in surface sediments from various water depths of the Gulf of Mexico. Open symbols indicate data from several transects, including the Mississippi River south pass, southwest pass, Atchafalaya River and Terrebone Bay³. Filled symbols show data for samples from both transects (A and B) analysed in this study (Table 1).

degradation of lignin side-chains by microorganisms such as whiterot fungi often produces ad/al > 0.4 (ref. 18). Furthermore, materials containing highly altered lignin (such as fine suspended river sediments¹⁹ and humic horizons of mineral soils²⁰) display values ranging from 0.4 to 4. Hence the ad/al ratios reported here, which are consistent with previous data³, indicate that all sedimentary lignins have been subjected to a high degree of oxidative degradation.

In transect A, individual lignin phenols, most notably syringic acid, display significantly more depleted isotopic compositions at the 107-m site (-29%) than those at deeper sites (-15%). In contrast, the δ^{13} C values of most lignin phenols at all sites from transect B are relatively enriched (~-22‰). These compoundspecific δ^{13} C values indicate that the sources of lignin to the Gulf of Mexico vary according to water depth and geographical location. Previously determined isotopic compositional ranges for individual lignin phenols² suggest that the OC_{terr} in the deeper sections of both transects has a dominant C4 source. In contrast, OCterr from the shallowest sections contains a high fraction of C3-derived lignin. Vanillin is different from other phenols because it is fairly depleted (-27 to -30%) in sediments from both transects. One possible explanation for these vanillin compositions could be the occurrence of a small amount of C₃ lignin from gymnosperm wood, which would yield vanillyl phenols exclusively, in sedimentary mixtures otherwise containing lignin from non-woody angiosperm C4 sources.

From the chemical (S/V, C/V and ad/al) and isotopic (δ^{13} C and Δ^{14} C) data, we infer that the source of the OC_{terr} present in the slope and abyssal plain of this region of the Gulf is highly reworked, recalcitrant soil organic matter (probably sorbed to fine mineral gains) exported from the extensive grasslands of the Mississippi River drainage basin¹⁰. The vegetation in North American grasslands is composed of C3 and C4 plants, with cool-season C3 species dominating in the northern ranges and warm-season C₄ species in the southern regions²¹. The δ^{13} C compositions of soil OC from the Great Plains correspond to the latitudinal distribution of vegetation and range from -14 to -23‰ (ref. 22). The ¹⁴C-depleted values of OC and the highly degraded nature of lignins from offshore sediments are consistent with the bulk of OC_{terr} at these locations being composed of recalcitrant fractions of soil organic matter with turnover times exceeding 1,000 years (ref. 23). The low lignin yields (typical of recalcitrant soil organic-matter pools²⁰) obtained from the interior regions of the Gulf of Mexico do not therefore negate the possibility of a significant OC_{terr} contribution. In contrast, a large fraction of the OCterr in the shelf regions of the Gulf of Mexico



(Fig. 2) seems to be less-degraded organic matter from C_3 sources, probably in the form of plant detritus from forests and swamps present in the lower reaches of the Mississippi River²⁴.

We do not yet know what causes these striking onshore-offshore trends in OC_{terr} composition. We propose that hydrodynamic sorting caused by the resuspension and cross-shelf transport of particles may serve to physically segregate distinct pools of OCterr. The result of this process is the preferential transport of grassland soil organic matter closely associated with the finer-grained mineral load (clays) of the Mississippi River to interior regions of the northwestern Gulf of Mexico. In contrast, coarser and denser organic matter, containing waterlogged vascular plant detritus, is retained in bays, estuaries and the inner shelf, along with silt and sand-sized mineral particles. Such hydrodynamic sorting processes have previously been inferred to explain the chemical compositions of sedimentary organic matter off the Washington margin^{4,25} and the Amazon and Bengal deep sea fans^{26,27}. In this case, however, hydrodynamic sorting also seems to control the isotopic composition of OC_{terr}. Aeolian transport provides an additional means of contributing compositionally distinct OCterr to the deeper regions of the Gulf of Mexico through entrainment of fine clay particles and their associated organic matter. However, the east-northeast trajectories of present-day prevailing winds suggest that this process is relatively unimportant.

Applying isotopic mass balance² to the δ^{13} C values of syringic acid, it is possible to evaluate the importance of C₄ lignin in sediments from both transects (Fig. 3). The relative abundances of lignin sources can then be used to estimate the average isotopic signature of OC_{terr} (Fig. 3). These calculations, bearing in mind the assumptions involved², show that C₄-derived OC modifies the isotopic signature of OC_{terr} (δ^{13} C_{terr} = -20% to -22%) in offshore Gulf sediments such that it is indistinguishable from marine OC (δ^{13} C_{mar} = -19% to -21%). In such instances, quantitative assessments of terrigenous organic matter inputs using bulk δ^{13} C_{OC} are difficult to accomplish, and may have led to an underestimation of allochthonous contributions^{3,5}.

Grasslands (both tropical and temperate) presently occupy nearly one-fifth of the Earth's surface²⁸. Given their wide distribution, our findings underscore the potential importance of grassland soils as sources of OC_{terr} to present-day oceans. The distribution and composition of grasslands are intimately connected with climate^{22,28}, so, climatic variability may have affected the export of OC_{terr} not only to contemporary but also to past oceans. For example, increased input of terrigenous C₃ carbon to the Gulf of Mexico during periods of low sea level has been inferred from the

Figure 3 Relative contribution of C3 (white bars) and C4 (shaded bars) vascular plants as sources of sedimentary lignin in the Gulf of Mexico, based on the isotopic composition of syringic acid (measured by irm-GC-MS) from sediments (Table 1) and from C_3 and C_4 end-members² (-30‰ and -15‰, respectively). The estimated isotopic composition of terrigenous organic carbon ($\delta^{13}C_{terr}$, triangles) and the measured δ^{13} C values bulk organic carbon ($\delta^{13}C_{OC}$, circles) are also shown. Details of the approach used to estimate $\delta^{13}C_{\text{terr}}$ have been discussed previously². Briefly, using isotopic mass balance, it is possible to estimate the relative abundance of C3 and C4 terrestrial organic matter sources in marine sediments from the δ^{13} C values of individual lignin phenols. However, the same lignin phenol may be derived from two different sources in vastly different quantities, depending on the nature and composition of the precursor (such as plant tissues versus soil OC). Hence, when interpreting these data, the role of oxidation yield in determining the isotopic signature of a given CuO product must be considered². Given these constraints, we used the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of the bestresolved lignin phenol, syringic acid (Table 1), to semi-quantitatively estimate the fraction of C₃ and C₄ angiosperm lignin in Gulf of mexico sediments. This choice appears justified because the lignin in most of the sediments analysed in this study seems to be derived from highly degraded angiosperm sources, and syringic acid is the best marker available for such material.

letters to nature

considerably depleted $\delta^{13}C_{OC}$ signatures obtained from sediments deposited during glacial epochs⁵. However, the observed glacialinterglacial isotopic variations could instead reflect changes from a C_3 -dominated (colder temperature) vegetation in the Mississippi River drainage basin during glaciations to a more C_4 -dominated vegetation in the Holocene epoch. This latter interpretation is supported by the known temperature-dependent latitudinal distribution of plants in present-day North American grasslands²¹. Application of these and other biological marker $\delta^{13}C$ data²⁹, in combination with compound-specific radiocarbon analysis¹⁴, to downcore studies of marine sediments may help us to understand the changes in vegetation (C_3 versus C_4) resulting from continental climate change in North America and other areas of the world^{22,27-30}.

Received 11 July; accepted 1 August 1997.

- 1. Hedges, J. I. Global biogeochemical cycles: Progress and problems. Mar. Chem. 39, 67-93 (1992).
- Goñi, M. A. & Eglinton, T. I. Stable carbon isotopic analyses of lignin-derived CuO oxidation products by isotope ratio monitoring–Gas Chromatography–Mass spectrometry (irm–GC–MS). Org. Geochem. 24, 601–615 (1966).
- Hedges, J. I. & Parker, P. L. Land-derived organic matter in surface sediments from the Gulf of Mexico Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 40, 1019–1029 (1976).
- Keil, R. G., Tsamakis, E., Bor Fuh, C., Giddings, J. C. & Hedges, J. I. Mineralogical and textural controls on the organic composition of coastal marine sediments: hydrodynamic separation using SPLITTfractionation. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 58, 879–893 (1994).
- Jasper, J. P. & Gagosian, R. B. Glacial-interglacial climatically forced δ¹³C variations in sedimentary organic matter. *Nature* 342, 60–62 (1989).
- Müller, P. J. & Suess, E. Productivity, sedimentation rate, and sedimentary organic matter in the ocean I. Organic carbon preservation. *Deep Sea Res.* 26, 1347–1367 (1979).
- Hedges, J. I. & Keil, R. G. Sedimentary organic matter preservation: an assessment and speculative synthesis. Mar. Chem. 49, 81–115 (1995).
- Martin, J. H., Knauer, G. A., Karl, D. M. & Broenkow, W. W. VERTEX: Carbon cycling in the northeast Pacific. Deep Sea Res. 34, 267–285 (1987).
- Van Andel, T. H. in *Recent Sediments, Northwestern Gulf of Mexico* (eds Shepard, F. P., Phleger, F. B. & Van Andel, T. H.) 34–55 (American Assoc. of Petrology and Geology, Tulsa, 1960).
- Sims, P. L. & Coupland, R. T. Producers. in Grassland Ecosystems of the World: Analyses of Grasslands and their Uses (ed. Coupland, R. T.) 49–72 (Cambridge Univ. Press, 1979).
- Deegan, L. A. et al. in *Estuary Variability* (ed. Wolfe, D. A.) 83–100 (Academic, New York, 1986).
 Ruttenberg, K. C. & Goñi, M. A. Phosphorous distribution, C: N: P ratios, and δ¹³C_{oc} in arctic, temperate, and tropical coastal sediments: tools for characterizing bulk sedimentary organic matter. *Mar. Geol.* 139, 123–145 (1997).
- Stuiver, M., Peason, G. W. & Braziunas, T. Radiocarbon age calibration of marine samples back to 9,00 cal yr. bp. *Radiocarbon* 28, 980–1021 (1986).
- Eglinton, T. I. et al. Variability in radiocarbon ages of individual organic compounds from marine sediments. Science 277, 796–799 (1997).
- Emerson, S. C. et al. Organic carbon in surface deep-sea sediments: C-14 concentration. Nature 329, 51–54 (1987).
- Hedges, J. I. & Mann, D. C. The characterization of plant tissues by their cupric oxide oxication products. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 43, 1803–1807 (1979).
- Opsahl, S. & Benner, R. Early diagenesis of vascular plant tissues: lignin and cutin decomposition and biogeochemical implications. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 59, 4889–4904 (1995).
- Goñi, M. A., Nelson, B., Blanchette, R. A. & Hedges, J. H. Fungal degradation of wood lignins: geochemical perspectives from CuO-derived phenolic dimers and monomers. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 57, 3985–4002 (1993).
- Hedges, J. I. et al. Compositions and fluxes of particulate organic material in the Amazon river. Limnol. Oceanogr. 31, 717–738 (1986).
- Ziegler, F., Kögel, I. & Zech, W. Z. Alteration of gymnosperm and angiosperm lignin during decomposition in forest humus layers. Z. Pflanzenernaehr. Bodenk. 149, 323–331 (1986).
- Teeri, J. A. & Stowe, L. G. Climatic patterns and the distribution of C₄ grasses in North America. Oecologia 23, 1–12 (1976).
- Tieszen, L. L. & Archer, S. in *Plant Biology of the Basin and Range* (eds Osmond, C. S., Pitelka, L. F. & Hidy, G. M.) 293–321 (Ecological Studies Ser. Vol. 80, Springer, Heidelberg, 1990).
- Parton, W. J., Schimel, D. S., Cole, C. V. & Ojima, D. S. Analysis of factors controlling soil organic matter levels in Great Plains grasslands. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* 51, 1173–1179 (1987).
- Chmura, G. L. Palynomorph distribution in marsh environments in the modern Mississippi Delta Plain. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. 106, 705–714 (1994).
- Prahl, F. G., Ertel, J. R., Goñi, M. A., Sparrow, M. A. & Eversmeyer, B. Terrestrial organic carbon contributions to sediments on the Washington margin. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 58, 3035–3048 (1994).
- Goñi, M. A. in Proceedings of the Ocean Drilling Program, Sci. Rep. 155 (eds Flood, R. D., Piper, D. J. W. & Klaus, A.) 519–530 (College Station, TX, 1997).
- France-Lanord, C. & Derry, L. A. δ¹³C of organic carbon in the Bengal Fan: source evolution and transport of C₃ and C₄ plant carbon to marine sediments. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 58, 4809–4814 (1994).
- Parton, W. J. et al. Observations and modeling of biomass and soil organic matter dynamics for the grassland biome worldwide. Global Biochem. Cycles 7, 785–809 (1993).
- Bird, M. I. et al. Terrestrial vegetation change inferred from n-alkane δ13C analysis in the marine environment. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 59, 2853–2857 (1995).
- Cerling, T. E., Wang, Y. & Quade, J. Expansion of C₄ ecosystems as an indicator of global ecological change in the late Miocene. *Nature* 361, 344–345 (1993).

Acknowledgements. We thank J. W. Morse for the opportunity to participate on the cruise in Gulf of Mexico; E. Tsamakis, K. Tholke, R. Ostermann, J. Irvine, N. Parmentier, L. Christman, J. Donahue and E. Tappa for help with sample preparation and analyses; and G. Eglinton, B. Fry, J. Jasper, J. Hedges, R. Benner, S. Smith and S. Montgomery for comments and discussions. This work was supported by the US NSF.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to M.A.G. (e-mail: goni@epoch.geol. sc.edu).

Trade-off between parasitoid resistance and larval competitive ability in Drosophila melanogaster

A. R. Kraaijeveld & H. C. J. Godfray

NERC Centre for Population Biology and Department of Biology, Imperial College at Silwood Park, Ascot, Berkshire SL5 7PY, UK

The extent to which an organism is selected to invest in defences against pathogens and parasites depends on the advantages that ensue should infection occur, but also on the costs of maintaining defences in the absence of infection. The presence of heritable variation in resistance suggests that costs exist, but we know very little about the nature or magnitude of these costs in natural populations of animals¹. A powerful technique for identifying trade-offs between fitness components is the study of correlated responses to artificial selection^{2,3}. We have selected Drosophila melanogaster for improved resistance against an endoparasitoid, Asobara tabida. Endoparasitoids are insects whose larvae develop internally within the body of other insects, eventually killing them, although their hosts can sometimes survive attack by mounting a cellular immune response⁴⁻⁶. We found that reduced larval competitive ability in unparasitized D. melanogaster is a correlated response to artificial selection for improved resistance against A. tabida. The strength of selection for competitive ability and parasitoid resistance is likely to vary temporally and spatially, which may explain the observed heritable variation in resistance.

Parasitoids are very common natural enemies of many insects, developing either externally or internally on their hosts⁷. Endoparasitoids frequently suspend development as eggs or first-instar larvae while their hosts feed and grow in size, although during this period they can be destroyed by encapsulation, a cellular immune response. Parasitoids avoid host defences by hiding in tissue away from circulating haemocytes, by avoidance of recognition through molecular mimicry, or through debilitating the immune response by toxins or symbiotic viruses⁶. Individual hosts often differ in their ability to encapsulate parasitoids, and selection, quantitative genetic and isofemale-line studies have shown this to have a genetic basis^{8–11}. The presence of additive genetic variation in encapsulation ability suggests that there are costs to the possession of defences against parasitoids, although these costs have yet to be identified in any host–parasitoid interaction.

Asobara tabida (Hymenoptera, Braconidae) is a common larval parasitoid of *Drosophila* species on fermenting substrates in Europe. In central and northern Europe its main host is *D. subobscura*, in which it is never encapsulated, although it is also found on *D. melanogaster* at low frequencies¹². In Mediterranean Europe *D. melanogaster* is the main host. Our base stock population of *D. melanogaster* was derived from 250 flies caught in the wild near Leiden in the Netherlands and maintained in the laboratory for three generations before the start of the experiment. The wasps used in the selection experiments were a laboratory strain derived originally from insects caught in Sospel, France, and cultured on *D. subobscura* to prevent adaptation to *D. melanogaster*. The base stock encapsulated only 5% of the eggs of the laboratory strain of *A. tabida*, a figure typical of fly populations from northern Europe¹³.

The base stock was split into eight lines, four of which were selected for increased encapsulation ability, the others acting as controls. Each new generation of the selection lines was bred from flies that had survived parasitoid attack (the encapsulated parasitoid egg remains in the body of the fly and can be seen through the wall of